



2030 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN UPDATE

STAFF REPORT

Section 6: Economic Development

OVERVIEW

The *Economic Development* section of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan lays out a vision for future economic vitality in the city. Policies and actions within this section have three goals: attracting new businesses, retaining and expanding existing businesses, and attracting investment to areas of the city that have suffered from lack of investment in recent years.

Figures related to job growth were outdated and have been refreshed as part of the Update to better reflect changing trends in employment. Additionally, employment projections were revised with figures from the Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization (CAMPO) to better reflect projected growth that will occur in the region.

No policies were removed from the *Economic Development* section as a result of the Update process. One new policy (ED 7.6 Adaptive Reuse for the Arts) was added to the section. This policy recommends pursuing opportunities to adapt obsolete industrial or commercial buildings for use by artists or other members creative industries. The White Paper recommended identifying arts as contributing to the local economy and incorporating them into the city's economic development efforts. Five policies were also revised as part of the Update process.

Four new actions were added, two actions were revised, and four actions were removed from the *Economic Development* section during the Update process.

As part of the Update process, the entire Plan received a round of general copy editing. Corrections for errors in grammar, punctuation, and internal consistency were made as needed without notation. Other minor technical changes to verbiage or terminology may have also been made without notation. For example, references to the city's defunct Zoning Ordinance were replaced with references to the Unified Development Ordinance, references to the "Multi-modal Transit Center" were replaced with "Union Station."

An account of detailed changes can be found in the attached "blackline" documents.

Update for May 28, 2019 Planning Commission Meeting

In response to comments received during the April 29, 2019 Planning Commission meeting the following revisions will be made to the draft version of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan:

- The duplication errors in the blackline document are primarily artifacts of font changes between versions and do not reflect actual content revisions. These will be removed to avoid confusion before the blacklines are transmitted to City Council as backup material for public hearings.
- Pg. 6-21 *Action ED 6.3 Cultural Resource Preservation Provide development incentives or financial incentives for preservation of cultural resources.* This action will receive a modification as shown to clarify meaning.
- Pg. 6-24 *Action ED 8.8 Post Disaster Strategic Planning In the event of a major disaster, conduct a strategic planning process focused on economic recovery, either along with or in addition to other recovery planning processes. The process would specifically consider economic recovery issues along with general recovery concerns. Initial efforts could be rapid and largely department-driven; in the case of larger disasters, a broader participatory effort could follow the initial response.* In response to a comment from Planning Commission regarding pre-disaster strategic planning; this type of hazard mitigation preparation is referenced elsewhere in the Plan. For example, *Environmental Protection* subsection 4: Flood Reduction and Preparedness; *Community Facilities and Services* subsection 4: Fire and Emergency Response; and *Regional and Interjurisdictional Coordination* subsection 6: Environmental Sustainability and Natural Resources.

Policies to be Amended by the Update:

New Policies (1)

- ED 7.6 Adaptive Use for the Arts

Removed Policies

- None

Revised Policies (5)

- ED 1.3 Gateway Reinvestment
- ED 3.14 Corporate Headquarters
- ED 8.2 Internal Coordination
- ED 8.3 Economic Development Equity
- ED 5.11 Targeting Investment

Actions to be Amended by the Update:

New Actions (4)

- ED 1.2 Promoting Commercial Reinvestment
- ED 3.5 Green Technology Strategy
- ED 3.6 Financial Assistance for New Retailers
- ED 8.8 Post-disaster Strategic Planning

Revised Actions (2)

- ED 2.5 Neighborhood Grants for Community Benefits
- ED 3.3 Wake Tech Green Collar Program

Removed Actions (4)

- ED 2.2 Community Oriented Government
- ED 5.1 Certification of Industrial Sites
- ED 5.6 Disposal of City-owned Land
- ED 8.2 Economic Development Annual Plan

HISTORY OF REVISIONS

Relevant Policies or Plans Adopted Since 2009

Raleigh Arts Plan

The Raleigh Arts Plan was adopted in February 2016 as a masterplan for the future of arts and culture in the city. There are eight goals for implementing the Raleigh Arts Plan. Many of the plan’s initiatives for achieving the goals link together economic development and the arts. This includes supporting artists and creators with funding, space, and enhancing neighborhoods through artistic placemaking.

Priority Areas for Economic Development

Map ED-1 Priority Areas for Economic Development was updated, and new language was added to the text box for the map. This update was a result of a city-initiated Comprehensive Plan Amendment separate from this update process. Map ED-1 identifies underperforming areas that could benefit from economic development activities. It is used as criteria for offering grants to property owners that are in locations designated as a priority area on the map.

Strategic Plan

The City of Raleigh Strategic Plan was adopted in 2015. There are Economic Development and Innovation objectives, each with initiatives for completion that are included in the Strategic Plan. The initiatives in the Strategic Plan are wide-ranging in nature, and vary from studying the local labor profile, to providing grants to as part of an Economic Development Toolkit, as well as creating a passport parking app that allow citizens to pay for downtown parking with their smartphones.

Relevant Topics from the White Paper

The White Paper identified many key Economic Development issues that are still considered to be relevant, as well recommendations for updates based on changing trends.

- The city's economic development efforts are now coordinated through the Office of Economic Development. Narrative on the organizational structure and administration of the city's economic development activities, particularly in Section ED.8 Organizational Structure and Functions, should be reviewed and updated accordingly. ***The introduction and subsection ED. 8 were updated to reflect that economic development efforts which were once spread between multiple departments are now coordinated through Office of Economic Development. Policies ED 8.2 Internal Coordination and ED 8.3 Economic Development Equity both now reflect the Office of Economic Development as the lead organization.***
- The city is working on a plan for the effective disposition of city-owned land. Once this plan is adopted, relevant text, policies and actions should be updated in this element. ***Action ED 5.6 Disposal of City Owned land was marked complete as a result of the Downtown Disposition Study.***
- The city has completed several corridor studies including Capital Boulevard, New Bern Avenue, and Southern Gateway that relate to policies and actions in Section D.1 Commercial Corridor Reinvestment. Review and update as needed based on adoption of these plans. ***Policy ED 1.3 Gateway Reinvestment was updated to focus investment on key gateways into the city and downtown. The focus was changed from Capital boulevard and New Bern Avenue to Six Forks Road and Avent Ferry Road. South Saunders Street remains a relevant corridor.***
- City Council has recently discussed creating a dedicated economic development fund and has directed staff to create criteria for ranking/ prioritizing projects for investment. This effort is related to Section D.5 Economic Development and Land Use and Map ED-1 Target Areas for Economic Redevelopment. This section should be updated as needed based on this effort. ***Map ED-1 was updated and added to the Comprehensive Plan as part of a city-initiated Comprehensive Plan Amendment.***
- The element should be reviewed to make sure that any mention of outdated or discontinued programs like the state's now defunct Urban Progress Zones are removed. ***Language that referred to the defunct Urban Progress Zones such as Policy 3.14 Corporate Headquarters have been removed from the section.***
- Identify the arts, historic resources, and parks and greenways as contributors to the local economy and incorporate these resources into economic development strategies. ***Policy 7.6 Adaptive Use for the Arts was created to pursue opportunities to adapt obsolete commercial and industrial buildings for use by artists and other makers.***

Other Changes

- **Table ED-1 2040 Employment Projections**

Table ED-1 2035 Employment Projections was renamed Table ED-1 2040 Employment Projections and updated with more recent data from the Capital Area Metropolitan Planning Organization. The narrative for the opening of the Economic Development Section was also rewritten to reflect the new data from CAMPO and changing employment trends in the Triangle region.

Four new actions were added:

- **Action ED 1.2 Promoting Commercial Investment.** Identify incentives and other economic development tools to promote reinvestment in underperforming commercial corridors. *This action compliments Policy 1.1 Corridor Revitalization, which calls for stimulating renewal along aging commercial corridors.*
- **Action ED 3.5 Green Technology Strategy.** Develop a regional strategy for attracting and supporting businesses and start-ups in the green technology industry with participation from regional economic development entities and research universities. *The Comprehensive Plan identifies Raleigh as a center for environmentally sustainable technologies and seeks to encourage new green businesses to locate in the city.*
- **Action ED 3.6 Financial Assistance for New Retailers.** Explore the creation of a loan pool, grant provisions, or revolving fund to provide gap financing to entrepreneurs interested in starting viable retail businesses downtown. *The Economic Development Office has a number of grant programs such the Downtown Raleigh Retail Up-Fit Grant and the Façade Grant Program that benefit downtown retailers. This action ensures that a focus remains on providing grants and revolving loans to retain and attract retailers to the downtown area.*
- **Action 8.8 Post Disaster Strategic Planning.** In the event of a major disaster, conduct a strategic planning process focused on economic recovery, either along with or in addition to other recovery planning processes. The process would specifically consider economic recovery issues along with general recovery concerns. Initial efforts could be rapid and largely department-driven; in the case of larger disasters, a broader participatory effort could follow the initial response. *This action will help to intertwine economic development with sustainability and resilience and supports the Comprehensive Plan vision theme Greenprint Raleigh.*

Two actions were revised:

- **Action ED 2.5 Neighborhood Grants for Community Benefits.** Consider a small neighborhood grant program to fund small community identified priority projects (e.g., play lot, community gardens, culture and arts initiatives) where the residents

take responsibility for on-going operation and maintenance. Some grant funding is available through the Parks and Recreation and Community Services departments. ***This action was previously listed as reserved; it has been reinitiated as part of the Update process.***

- **Action ED 3.3 Wake Tech Green Collar Program.** Develop a regional strategy for attracting and supporting businesses and start-ups in the green technology industry with participation from regional economic development entities and research universities. ***This action has had its time frame changed from long-term to on-going.***

Four actions were removed:

- **Action ED 2.2 Community Oriented Government.** Expand the use of the Community-Oriented Government model to increase coordination among community leaders, City departments, and affected stakeholders in order to prioritize and implement strategies for neighborhood improvement wherever feasible. The goal of Community-Oriented Government is to build strong relationships, provide solutions to complex community issues, create sustainable solutions for community concerns, and establish proactive measures to prevent community problems. ***This action was found to be no longer a relevant component of the Economic Development section.***
- **Action 5.1 Certification of Industrial Sites.** Assist owners in preparing and certifying their industrially-zoned sites to become more competitive (a certified site has water, sewer, and roadway access and has undergone a Phase 1 environmental assessment). ***The development review process already requires that a site has sewer, water, and roadway access.***
- **Action ED 8.2 Economic Development Annual Report.** Prepare an annual report on economic development and progress achieved toward the strategic plan's goals and objectives. ***This action has been achieved, and continues to be evaluated through the City's strategic plan process.***
- **ED 5.6 Disposal of City-owned Land.** Develop criteria and a strategy for disposing of City-owned lands. Explore the formation of partnerships between multiple public entities to master develop and maximize the utility of publicly-controlled land. ***The white paper recommend that this action be marked "complete" as the Downtown Disposition Study achieved it's goal.***

Consistency with Vision Themes

The theme of **Economic Prosperity and Equity** is addressed through a new action to identify incentives that will promote reinvestment in under performing corridors. to provide financial assistance to new retailers through tools such as a loan pool, grant provisions, or a revolving fund for gap financing to assist entrepreneurs trying to start retail businesses downtown. Policy language was added to for adaptive reuse of outdated industrial building for use by artists and other creative “maker” industries.

Greenprint Raleigh - Sustainable Development is supported by action ED 3.5 Green Technology Strategy which calls for developing a regional strategy for attracting and supporting businesses in the green technology industry. Action ED 8.8 Post Disaster Strategic Planning was also added to focus on economic revitalization as part of the recovery planning process.

Departments Consulted

The Office of Economic Development was consulted during the update for this section of the Comprehensive Plan. The update reflects that the Office of Economic Development is now the primary organization for coordinating economic development efforts throughout the city.



2030 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN UPDATE

STAFF REPORT

Section 7: Housing

OVERVIEW

The *Housing* section of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan section has seen significant changes in narrative content and policy direction as a result of the Housing and Neighborhoods Department’s ongoing work program. Housing in Raleigh continues to be among the most difficult challenges to face the future of the city. The joint efforts of the Raleigh Housing and Neighborhoods Department, Wake County, and other state and local actors are critical to addressing the growing need for housing and are reflected in policy statements and action items throughout this section of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan.

The *Housing* section emphasizes the importance of providing a range of housing types throughout Raleigh and assuring housing opportunities for all segments of the city’s population. The changes in this section are in response to several key planning and policy documents that have come forward since the adoption of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan. These critical plans and policies are:

- The Five-Year Consolidated Plan guides the city’s investment in affordable housing with an emphasis on increasing the supply of affordable housing, enhancing the homeless to housing continuum, and neighborhood revitalization.
- The Affordable Housing Improvement Plan provides seven financial options to address the city’s housing needs.
- The Affordable Housing Location Plan provides locational guidance on the creation and preservation of affordable housing.
- The Strategic Plan’s Safe, Vibrant, and Healthy Community initiative promotes clean, engaged community environments where people feel safe and enjoy access to community amenities that support a high quality of life.

Together, these plans identify the need for more affordable housing, where it should be preserved and created, and how it should be funded. Accordingly, the “Affordable Housing” and “Quality and Diversity of Housing” subsections are proposed to be most heavily altered.

As part of the Update process, the entire Plan received a round of general copy editing. Corrections for errors in grammar, punctuation, and internal consistency were made as needed without notation. Other minor technical changes to verbiage or terminology may have also been made without notation. For example, references to the city's defunct Zoning Ordinance were replaced with references to the Unified Development Ordinance, references to the "Multi-modal Transit Center" were replaced with "Union Station."

An account of detailed changes can be found in the attached "blackline" documents.

Policies to be Amended by the Update:

New Policies (2)

- H 1.9 Housing Diversity
- H 2.16 Existing Housing

Removed Policies (8)

- H 1.3 Energy Efficiency
- H 1.7 Public Housing Alteration
- H 2.2 Expanded Housing Assistance
- H 2.3 Non-Profit Capacity Building
- H 2.4 Housing Preservation
- H 2.8 Accessory Dwelling Units
- H 3.4 Integrated Core Programs
- H 3.5 Supportive Housing

Revised Policies (10)

- H 1.2 Geographic Dispersal of Affordable Units
- H 1.4 Affordable Housing Design
- H 1.8 Zoning for Housing
- H 2.7 Affordable Set-asides in Projects
- H 2.10 Incentives on Private Sites
- H 2.12 Minimize Displacement
- H 2.13 Transit Accessibility
- H 3.2 Supportive Services
- H 3.3 Assistance to Homeless Service Providers
- H 4.1 Fair Housing Act Enforcement

Actions to be Amended by the Update:

New Actions (3)

- H 1.6 Housing Variety
- H 2.23 Additional Affordable Housing Tools
- H 2.24 Zoning for Mixed Income

Removed Actions (10)

- H 1.4 Consistency Between Plans
- H 1.5 City and RHA Meetings
- H 2.1 Housing Trust Fund
- H 2.2 Community Land Trust
- H 2.4 Bundling Public Sites
- H 2.5 Scattered Site Policy Change
- H 2.6 Review of Housing Loan Policies
- H 2.7 Fast-Tracking Affordable Units
- H 2.10 Education Material for Removing Barriers
- H 3.1 Ending Homelessness Action Plan

Revised Actions (2)

- H 1.1 Affordable Rental Program Expansion
- H 3.3 Financial Support for Nonprofits Addressing Homelessness

HISTORY OF REVISIONS

Major Housing Initiatives Since 2009

Five-Year Consolidated Plan

The Five-Year Consolidated Plan describes the city's affordable housing and community and economic development strategies from July 2015 to June 2020. The plan identifies priorities housing and community development needs for very low-, low-, and moderate-income city residents and the strategies to address them. The Consolidated Plan is required by the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) for the City to receive Community Development Block Grant (CDBG), HOME Investment Partnerships Program (HOME), and Emergency Solutions Grant (ESG) funds.

Affordable Housing Improvement Plan

The Affordable Housing Improvement Plan was adopted by City Council in October 2015. This plan lays out seven options to address the city's housing needs:

1. Expand the use of the 4% Tax Credit for Affordable Housing Allocated through the North Carolina Housing Finance Agency
2. Site Acquisition Assistance for Affordable Rental Development: Provide Financial Resources
3. Infill Homeownership Development Program: Provide Financial Resources
4. Affordable Rental Preservation/Creation through 0% Forgivable Loans to Developers
5. Downtown Neighborhoods Revitalization Plans for Specific Areas of Focused City Investment
6. Homeless Coordinated Intake Center and Expansion of Housing Supply: Creation of an Intake Center and Providing More Permanent Supportive Housing
7. Permanent Affordable Housing Funding Source: Find Sustaining Sources of Funding

Affordable Housing Location Policy

The purpose of the Affordable Housing Location Policy is to set forth desired outcomes relative to the creation or preservation of affordable multi-family rental housing with the overall goal of affirmatively furthering fair housing choice for all residents. Specific objectives of the Policy include the following:

- To increase the supply of affordable housing in underserved locations near employment and commercial centers;
- To encourage the development of affordable housing near existing and proposed transit services;
- To provide for affordable housing in and near downtown Raleigh and in neighborhoods having approved revitalization plans; and,
- To prevent further concentrations of minority and low-income persons and subsidized housing.

Action H 1.1 Affordable Rental Program Expansion was revised to incorporate the specific locational guidance provided within the Affordable Housing Location Policy. The revised action encourages incentives for private developers to preserve lower-cost rental units instead of demolishing them.

Relevant Topics from the White Paper

- New statistical data such as national and local affordability indices. ***These statistics were updated.***
- Note of pending studies such as the regional Analysis of Impediments and Fair Housing Choice. ***The regional Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice (AI) has been completed. The AI was noted as a recent initiative and a summary has been added to page 25 of the Housing Section.***
- Reference to pertinent Objectives and Initiatives of the city's Strategic Plan. ***Alignment with the Strategic Plan has been reflected throughout the Housing section. The Strategic Plan has been noted as a recent Raleigh initiative and housing-specific objectives have been added to page 15 of the Housing section.***
- Amendments to existing policies and actions recommended by staff to reflect changes of approach and priority. ***Policies and actions were updated based on input from the Department of Housing and Neighborhoods to reflect other adopted plans and priorities.***

Other Changes

None of the changes made to the Housing chapter were outside the scope of the White Paper.

Policy Changes

Ten policies were revised:

- **H 1.2 Geographic Dispersal of Affordable Units.** Promote dispersal and production of affordable ~~and workforce~~ housing units throughout all areas of the city using the city's Housing Location Policy adopted in 2015. ***The term "workforce housing" was removed from the policy to encourage a broader applicability.***
- **H 1.4 Affordable Housing Design ~~Assisted Housing Design.~~** All housing, including ~~assisted subsidized affordable~~ and market rate housing, should be designed so that it blends with the context of the neighborhood in which it is located, emphasizing quality design and appearance. ***This change was made to reflect the use of the term "subsidized affordable housing," which better aligns the Plan with industry terminology.***
- **H 1.8 Zoning for Housing.** Ensure that zoning policy continues to provide ample opportunity for developers to build a variety of housing types, ranging from single-family to dense multi-family. Keeping the market well supplied with housing will

moderate the costs of owning and renting, lessening affordability problems, and lowering the level of subsidy necessary to produce affordable housing. In areas characterized by detached houses, accommodations should be made for additional housing types while maintaining a form and scale similar to existing housing. ***This policy was expanded to include the consideration for “missing middle housing,” a term a term used to describe housing types that are between detached houses and mid-rise apartments, in terms of bulk, scale, and density.***

- **H 2.7 Affordable Set-asides in Projects.** ~~Include a set-aside of~~ Encourage a 20% minimum set-aside of affordable housing units in housing or mixed-use projects involving City-owned ~~or other publicly-owned~~ properties. ~~For City-owned properties, the set aside should be 15 to 20 percent.~~ ***This policy was revised to specify a 20% benchmark for city-owned properties.***
- **H 2.10 Incentives on Private Sites.** ~~Provide incentives for the development of~~ Incentivize private developers to create new affordable housing on privately-owned vacant sites through city funding. ***This revision is a matter of housekeeping. The policy implication is the same.***
- **H 2.12 Avoiding Minimize Displacement.** ~~Support programs that minimize residential displacement by redevelopment activity and provide replacement housing in the general area of the original housing. Minimize residential displacement resulting from redevelopment activity and provide replacement housing.~~ ***This policy was rewritten to improve clarity.***
- **H 2.13 Transit Accessibility.** Preferentially locate affordable housing in areas with good access to transit services and/or locate transit in areas currently occupied by subsidized affordable housing. ***This policy was expanded to inform transit decisions based on existing affordable housing.***
- **H 3.2 Supportive Services.** ~~Continue and~~ Strengthen linkages and coordination between among all public and nonprofit agencies and Public Housing Authorities (PHAs) that provide affordable housing and supportive services ~~and businesses.~~ ***This policy was amended to broaden its applicability.***
- **H 3.3 Assistance to Homeless Service Providers.** Promote the efforts of ~~governmental~~ government agencies, the Continuum of Care, non-profit organizations, and the private sector ~~such as, the Continuum of Care Collaborative, Wake County Supportive Housing, Wake County Housing and Community Development~~ to increase access to emergency shelter, rapid re-housing and homelessness prevention programs, as well as increase the supply of transitional, emergency housing services and, permanent housing, and permanent supportive housing for the homeless individuals and families. ***This policy was revised to improve clarity.***

- **H 4.1 Fair Housing Act Enforcement.** ~~Ensure~~ Promote enforcement of the federal Fair Housing Act through landlord training and conferences to provide equal access to housing and prevent unfair lending practices. ***This policy was expanded to include specific programmatic strategies for implementation.***

Eight policies were removed:

- **H 1.3 Energy Efficiency.** Ensure that all new publicly-supported housing construction and rehabilitation meet energy efficiency standards, such as those set by the current System Vision Energy Guarantee Program. ***This policy was removed because the city does not control all of the publicly-supported housing being constructed or rehabbed throughout the city. Also, the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) has greatly increased the energy conservation standards for projects that receive federal funding.***
- **H 1.7 Public Housing Alteration.** The Raleigh Housing Authority (RHA) should jointly plan with City departments, and City departments should take the initiative in assisting the RHA, in the early stages of major renovations, large new developments, and redevelopments, such as projects undertaken under the HOPE VI program, so as to facilitate a smooth land development process. ***The RHA must follow the same city development rules as all other land developers. Also, the HOPE VI program was eliminated soon after the adoption of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan in 2009 and the associated federal resources for replacement or rehab of public housing are no longer available.***
- **H 2.2 Expanded Housing Assistance.** Expand the City’s range of housing assistance programs benefiting low- and moderate-income persons by supplementing existing federal and state programs. ***This policy was removed because it is addressed in the Affordable Housing Improvement Plan.***
- **H 2.3 Non-Profit Capacity Building.** Work with non-profit housing providers to expand their capacity to develop affordable housing. ***This policy was expanded and renamed “Assistance to Homeless Service Providers.”***
- **H 2.4 Housing Preservation.** Encourage reinvestment, preservation, and maintenance of the existing housing stock to prevent the conversion of existing affordable housing units to market-rate units, including funding the City’s housing rehabilitation programs. ***This policy was removed from this subsection and moved to another subsection. It is now titled Policy H 2.16 Existing Housing. The language is identical to the new policy.***
- **H 2.8 Accessory Dwelling Units.** Promote the construction of accessory dwelling units above garages, or “granny flats,” and cottage/small lot ordinances, to provide affordable and workforce housing options and help accommodate future citywide residential demand. ***This was and replaced with Policy LU 8.16 Accessory Dwelling Units that supports the provision and regulation of ADUs.***

- **H 3.4 Integrated Core Programs.** Support Wake County in creating an integrated, comprehensive system of care to provide health and behavioral health care, housing, and social services. *This policy was removed because Wake County has since created these services.*
- **H 3.5 Supportive Housing.** Promote development of additional housing serving persons with disabilities. *This policy was reworded as “Housing for Persons Who are Disabled.”*

Two policies were added:

- **H 1.9 Housing Diversity.** Promote housing diversity and affordable housing choices for households at 60 percent of AMI or below in the immediate area around transit corridors. *This policy was added to increase housing choices in areas with access to multimodal forms of transportation.*
- **H 2.16 Existing Housing.** Encourage reinvestment and maintenance of the existing housing stock to prevent the conversion of affordable housing units to market-rate units, including funding the city’s housing rehabilitation programs. *This policy replaced Policy H 2.4 Housing Preservation, which used to appear in a different subsection. The language is identical to the old policy.*

Action Changes

Two actions were revised:

- **H 1.1 Affordable Rental Program Expansion.** ~~Acquire and maintain, through the City of Raleigh's Affordable Rental Program, additional affordable rental units for households below 50 percent of median income throughout all areas of the city. Continue to create new programs to implement the 2015 Affordable Housing Improvement Plan that will provide incentives to private developers to preserve lower-cost rental communities in Raleigh instead of demolishing or converting them to upscale rental housing.~~ *The Affordable Housing Improvement Plan focuses city resources on preserving existing privately owned affordable rental units and assisting in the development of new privately owned affordable rental units.*
- **H 3.3 Financial Support for Nonprofits Addressing Homelessness.** ~~Continue to financially support the activities of non-profits nonprofits to provide transitional and emergency housing services for to the services to the homeless and those at-risk of homelessness, such as homelessness prevention and diversion, rapid rehousing, emergency shelter, and permanent supportive housing.~~ *This language was revised to reflect the most recent federal laws and financing programs.*

Ten actions were removed:

- **H 1.4 Consistency Between Plans.** Review RHA annual action plans to ensure consistency with Raleigh’s Consolidated Plan, neighborhood plans, and Raleigh’s Redevelopment Area Plans. *This action was completed in 2014. The Raleigh Housing Authority (RHA) is responsible for making sure that their programs are consistent with the city’s Consolidated Plan.*
- **H 1.5 City and RHA Meetings.** Institute regular meetings between City departments and the RHA to review ongoing or future construction / redevelopment projects. *This policy was removed because the federal money for public housing authorities, mainly HOPE VI, no longer exist.*
- **H 2.1 Housing Trust Fund.** Create a local dedicated source of funding for affordable housing which is recurring and included in the 5-year capital budget. *This action was completed in 2011 with the approval of the 1% tax increase for housing.*
- **H 2.2 Community Land Trust.** Explore creating additional affordable housing using vehicles (such as a Community Land Trust, deed restrictions, and long-term shared equity appreciation mechanism) to assure long-term or permanent affordability of housing. *This action was removed and replaced with Action H 2.23 Additional Affordable Housing Tools.*
- **H 2.4 Bundling Public Sites.** Bundle prime City-owned development sites, such as downtown sites, with sites located in neighborhoods in need of reinvestment and affordable housing and in High Priority Areas, as defined in Raleigh’s Scattered Site Policy. Developers bidding to develop the prime sites would also have to make plans for the redevelopment of the bundled sites. *This action was removed with the retirement of the Scattered Site Policy (replaced with the Affordable Housing Location Policy). This action had also seen implementation with Downtown Land Disposition Strategy, which identified city-owned land that could be sold to meet policy goals, housing among them.*
- **H 2.5 Scattered Site Policy Change.** Modify the City’s Scattered Site Policy to provide greater flexibility to developers to create more mixed-income communities by indexing local requirements to the requirements of the state low-income housing tax credit program so as to enable larger mixed-income developments and increase the number of affordable units produced, while ensuring that affordable units are distributed throughout the development. *This action was completed in 2015 with the adoption of the new Housing Location Policy.*
- **H 2.6 Review of Housing Loan Policies.** Review City housing loan policies to ensure that requirements for return on investment do not override goals of affordable and middle-income housing. *The rehab loan program has been changed to be a forgivable loan with no payments due to the city.*

- **H 2.7 Fast-Tracking Affordable Units.** Provide an expedited or fast-tracking development review process for housing developments that include at least 10 percent affordable units or 20 percent workforce units. *This action was removed because there is no current mechanism available to city staff to monitor and enforce affordability and renter income levels.*
- **H 2.10 Education Material for Removing Barriers.** Develop educational material promoting the benefits of having a balanced distribution of affordable units in Raleigh. *This action was completed with the new marketing strategy deployed by the Housing and Neighborhoods department.*
- **H 3.1 Ending Homelessness Action Plan.** Implement prevention, housing, and service strategies outlined in the 2005 document Ending Homelessness: The Ten-Year Action Plan. *This action was removed because the 2005 Ten-Year Action Plan expired in 2015.*

Three actions were added:

- **H 1.6 Housing Variety.** Study housing policy and regulation with a focus on infill development and the accommodation of housing types, such as duplexes, small apartments, and townhouses in areas where they are not currently permitted. *This action is referencing “missing middle housing,” a term used to describe housing types that are between detached houses and mid-rise apartments, in terms of bulk, scale, and density. The city is in the early stages of studying this affordability strategy.*
- **H 2.23 Additional Affordable Housing Tools.** Explore creating additional affordable housing using vehicles (such as Community Land Trust, deed restrictions, and long-term shared equity appreciation mechanisms) to assure long-term or permanent affordability of housing. *This action replaces H 2.2 Community Land Trust. It was moved to this subsection in the update as a matter of housekeeping.*
- **H 2.24 Zoning for Mixed Income.** Develop zoning provisions for transit-oriented development that promote housing diversity and affordable housing choices available to households at 60 percent of AMI or below in the immediate area around transit corridors. *This action was added to facilitate the use of housing tax credits and federal HOME funding.*

Consistency with Vision Themes

The *Housing* section of the Plan emphasizes the importance of diversifying housing types throughout Raleigh and providing housing opportunities for all segments of the city's population. This section is critical to the theme of **Expanding Housing Choice**, which envisions Raleigh as a place with an expanded supply of decent affordable housing. This expanded supply of housing will bring stability for more families in Raleigh, improving access to educational and career advancement.

Expanded education and career opportunities provided by stable housing will allow more families to participate in the city's expanding economy, reaffirming the theme of **Economic Prosperity and Equity**.

The recently adopted Affordable Housing Location Policy lists among its four chief criteria the creation or preservation of affordable housing near existing and proposed transit services. For many families, housing is the greatest annual expense. This cost can be alleviated with lower costs for transportation. Encouraging the development of affordable housing in areas with good access to existing and planned transit is supported by the theme of **Coordinating Land Use and Transportation**.

Departments Consulted

Housing and Neighborhoods Department's role in the update to this section of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan included a largely wholesale rewrite of the section content and realignment with their most current policies and programs.



2030 COMPREHENSIVE PLAN UPDATE

STAFF REPORT

Section 17.6: Implementation – Participation in Planning

OVERVIEW

This report outlines an added subsection to the final section of the 2030 Comprehensive Plan, *Implementation*, that emerged from input received during the Update process. The new subsection addresses public participation in planning, with the specific aim of ensuring a more inclusive and meaningful participation process.

During the round of public input regarding proposed Comprehensive Plan revisions that took place in 2017, commenters expressed difficulty in attending the meetings (five were held, each on a different topic) in person. This is a theme often heard more generally – that busy evening schedules, child care, mobility issues, and other barriers make it difficult or impossible for many people to participate in-person in planning processes.

Themes of equity and fairness are deeply embedded in the Plan’s vision themes. The theme of **Economic Prosperity and Equity**, for instance, envisions “a high level of opportunity and quality of life for all residents” and that “educational and training programs will provide the opportunity for all of Raleigh’s population to participate in the expanding economy.” Similarly, the theme of **Expanding Housing Choices** speaks to “an expanded supply of affordable and workforce housing options that provide housing opportunities for all segments of our population.”

Planning processes regularly involve decisions that relate to these themes. However, if many residents find it difficult to participate in those processes due to barriers such as work schedules, child care, language obstacles, or discomfort or unfamiliarity with navigating the process, then it will be difficult if not impossible to ensure equitable outcomes.

Accordingly, staff has developed a new Comprehensive Plan subsection that addresses the issue of public input. The new subsection is based heavily on the American Planning Association’s recent “Sustaining Places” initiative, an effort that addresses the connections between planning and sustainability. It includes policies aimed at making it easier for residents to take part in important plans and decisions.

As this is a new subsection, no blackline version exists.

Policies to be Amended by the Update:

New Policies (3)

- IM 6.1 Access to Participation
- IM 6.2 Authentic Participation
- IM 6.3 Equality of Input

Actions to be Amended by the Update:

New Actions (1)

- IM 6.1 Input Study

Maps to be Amended by the Update:

- This subsection contains no maps.

Text Boxes to be Amended by the Update:

- No text boxes were revised.

HISTORY OF REVISIONS

Relevant Policies or Plans Adopted Since 2009

2030 Comprehensive Plan

The 2030 Comprehensive Plan was drafted to respond to the significant market, economic, social, and environmental changes facing Raleigh at the start of the 21st century. Because the Plan reflects the shared vision of the city’s residents, incorporating a policy framework for how input should be gathered and used on an ongoing basis aligns with the fundamental purpose of the Plan.

Strategic Plan

The City of Raleigh Strategic Plan was adopted in 2015. Embedded throughout the Strategic Plan is the goal of improving transparency and responsiveness to citizen input, values that aligns directly with the Update’s public participation subsection. Specifically, Strategic Plan Initiative 2.1, which focuses on increased online accessibility, and Strategic Plan Objective 3, which states “Expand effective and equitable customer service that engages all stakeholders through transparency, cooperation, and feedback,” connect to this new subsection.

Relevant Topics from the White Paper

The White Paper forecasted and informed the changes included in this update.

- Reflect coordination with the city’s Strategic Plan. ***As noted above, the new subsection is intended to align with the Strategic Plan’s values regarding transparency, openness, and meaningful public interaction with city decisions.***

Consistency with Vision Themes

As noted in the introduction, the subsection is consistent with the Plan’s themes, particularly those of **Economic Prosperity and Equity** and **Expanding Housing Choices**.

Departments Consulted

Other city departments have had the opportunity to review the materials but have not been specifically consulted.

17.6 Participation in Planning

Public participation is at the core of every planning process. Citizens have the right to help shape the future of their city, and the planning process is one of the primary means of doing so. Additionally, plans developed without adequate input fail to inspire the deep support needed for the hard work of implementation.

Raleigh's Comprehensive Plan accordingly places a high value on public input, both in the creation of the plan and in its ongoing implementation. Public participation does not end with Plan adoption, but continues in the hundreds of meetings and decisions that will take place as the Plan guides the future development of Raleigh.

Authentic Participation (from the American Planning Association's "Sustaining Places")

The American Planning Association's Sustaining Places initiative is a multiyear effort to define the role of planning in addressing issues related to sustainability. The initiative focuses on comprehensive plans, but its recommendations are relevant to all planning activities. A key element involves what the initiative calls "Authentic Participation." An excerpt is below.

Ensure that the planning process actively involves all segments of the community in analyzing issues, generating visions, developing plans, and monitoring outcomes.

Public participation in planning is a mainstay of democratic governance and decision making. By actively involving the whole community in making and implementing plans, the government fulfills its responsibilities to keep all citizens informed and to offer them the opportunity to influence those actions that affect them. In the past, public participation processes did not necessarily reach all segments of the community and may have been viewed by public agencies more as a requirement to meet (for example, by conducting public hearings) than as an opportunity to garner meaningful input. This means that authentic participation processes

may have to overcome the perception that what participants say will not be respected. Authentic participation programs go beyond the minimum legal requirements to connect with citizens through innovative communication and outreach channels, such as creative use of the Internet and interactive workshops in locations where people work and live. The comprehensive planning process is an ideal vehicle for opening all stages of plan making to the public, from early issue analysis to finalizing and implementing the plan.

Best practices in support of the Authentic Participation process include the following:

- *Engage stakeholders at all stages of the planning process.*
- *Seek diverse participation in the planning process.*
- *Promote leadership development in disadvantaged communities through the planning process.*
- *Develop alternative scenarios of the future.*
- *Provide ongoing and understandable information for all participants.*
- *Use a variety of communications channels to inform and involve the community.*
- *Continue to engage the public after the comprehensive plan is adopted.*

Barriers to Participation

While the importance of public input is widely recognized, identifying the ideal planning process has been an elusive goal. Traditionally, the public input process has focused heavily on in-person meetings and workshops. While these meetings, typically held during a weekday evening, can be a valuable means of gathering input and should remain a key component of the input process, they are not without serious drawbacks. While meetings, in theory, may be accessible to all, in practice they often screen out large segments of the public.

The first issue is time commitment. Busy parents, those working two jobs, service workers on the evening shift, college students cramming for the exam—these and others may have difficulty freeing up a couple of hours during an evening to participate in a planning workshop. The issue is compounded by the fact that effective participation often requires attendance at multiple public workshops and meetings at different phases of the project, and the adoption process adds multiple additional meetings. Where one meeting might pose a hurdle, a year or more of meetings can be a wall. The planning process should not be a test of endurance, where the person willing and able to attend a long series of planning and adoption meetings enjoys, de facto, greater weight in the process than the working mom who managed to fit in one meeting (or online survey) into her schedule.

The format of many planning meetings also favors certain groups over others, particularly those who are regular participants in civic affairs. People with limited mobility, limited English speakers, those who are uncomfortable speaking in groups, and people not well versed in the language of planning all are less likely to participate in this way.



In addition to filtering out specific groups, the high barriers to participation tend to filter out categories of opinion. For many planning decisions, the benefits may be diffuse and further in the future, while the perceived detriments may be more localized and immediate. Those who see some mild personal or public benefit to a project or plan are less likely to invest their time in support of it. Those who perceive an immediate threat are more likely to deeply engage. The beneficiaries, even if greater in number, are often outvoted by those objecting to a change.

Finally, many citizens do not participate because they do not have confidence that their input will matter. While not all suggestions can be incorporated and not all ideas are equal, a minimum expectation for someone participating in a planning process should be that their thoughts are documented, retained, and, where possible, receive a specific response. That response should be in the form of an explanation of how the input shaped, or did not shape, the final product.

Solutions: Making Input Easier

The problems described above should concern anyone interested in truly democratic and equitable planning. Planning departments, including Raleigh's, have increasingly recognized the limitations of traditional methods and have worked to mitigate these with a range of strategies.

Planners have created an expanded toolkit for engagement, including “pop-up” events aimed at bringing the meeting to the people, rather than requiring people to come to the meeting. Other techniques and tools, such as making more information available online and using surveys (both in-person and online), have expanded the conversation further, bringing new participants into the process. Even traditional meetings can be made more accessible by choosing convenient locations; providing on-site childcare for families and translators for persons of low English proficiency; purging presentations and meeting materials of obtuse and technical language; using clear visuals; and using facilitation techniques and electronic polling to overcome the tendency of louder voices to dominate the conversation.

However, more work is needed, and technology is making new solutions available. In an age where we entrust our financial transactions and our public personas to web sites and social media apps, there are no obvious obstacles to shifting much of the planning conversation online as well. There is no particular reason why a resident must attend an in-person meeting to have her or his voice heard, and there is no reason why online input should be devalued in relation to in-person input.

While technical challenges remain, the future will be one where meaningful participation in the planning process is not contingent on the ability to attend a series of meetings. If votes are taken in person, they should be taken online as well. If meetings take place in person, they should be available, in real time and with the ability to participate, online as well.



My preference for the Six Forks Corridor is:

Option A - New Streetscape includes:

- Consistent four-lane section through corridor
- Narrower median with small trees and shrubs
- Separated bicycle lanes
- Wide sidewalks
- Consolidated and enhanced bus stop amenities
- Does not provide additional car traffic capacity
- Requires 5.85 acres of right-of-way acquisition

Option B - Original Recommendation includes:

- Consistent six-lane section through corridor
- Wide median with large trees
- Separated bicycle lanes
- Wide sidewalks
- Consolidated and enhanced bus stop amenities
- Provides additional car traffic capacity
- Requires 11.06 acres of right-of-way acquisition

The second major means of making the planning process more accessible and democratic is less about technical advancements and more about how input is perceived. Human nature tends to give more weight to the person in the room than to an abstract tally on an online survey. However, the luxury of being able to attend a meeting in person should not translate into a louder voice in the process. It is incumbent upon all public servants to ensure that all input is treated with respect and given equal weight in the planning process.

These solutions can be summarized in a guarantee to ensure that Raleigh’s citizens enjoy three essential rights:

- ***The right to participate.*** Participation in the planning process will be accessible to all residents, regardless of physical ability, age, English fluency, ability to attend all meetings in person, and any other factor that presents a barrier to participating in decisions about the future of Raleigh.
- ***The right to understand.*** Information about the planning process and alternatives must be presented plainly and understandably. Once input is provided, citizens have a right to an explanation of how it was considered and whether and how it affected the outcome.
- ***The right to an equal voice.*** Input is equally valued regardless of how it is provided, whether it is in the form of attendance at an in-person meeting, an online meeting, a survey, or other means.

Finally, with rights come responsibilities. In this case, those participating in the public input process have the responsibility to give thought to alternative perspectives and to consider the effects of decisions on the city and region as a whole and in the long term.

The Plan’s establishment of these rights will make Raleigh a leader in creating a truly authentic and meaningful planning process and, more importantly, create a more engaged citizenry and a more just city.

Policy IM 6.1 Access to Participation

Design and implement planning processes that are accessible to the greatest possible number of citizens, regardless of whether they are able to attend meetings in person.



Policy IM 6.2 Authentic Participation

In every planning process, carefully document the input received and report back to the community with a summary of major themes and an explanation of how the input was incorporated into the final plan.



Policy IM 6.3 Equality of Input

Give equal weight in the planning process to public input regardless of the form in which it is provided.



Action IM 6.1. Input Study

Study methods for broadening participation in all planning processes, including a focus on online participation. Develop a best practices manual containing a toolkit and templates for participation.