



**RHDC**  
 RALEIGH HISTORIC  
 DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

# CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS PLACARD

for Raleigh Historic Resources

404 ELM STREET

Address

OAKWOOD

Historic District

Historic Property

025-16-MW

Certificate Number

2/8/2016

Date of Issue

8/8/2016

Expiration Date

**Project Description:**

- Replace metal trim and flashing with copper;
- replaces front and rear roofs with copper;
- remove utility chimney

OK to PERMIT

*This card must be kept pasted in a location within public view until all phases of the described project are complete. The work must conform with the code of the City of Raleigh and laws of the state of North Carolina. When your project is complete, you are required to ask for a final zoning inspection in a historic district area. Telephone the RHDC office at 832-7238 and commission staff will coordinate the inspection with the Inspections Department. If you do not call for this final inspection, your Certificate of Appropriateness is null and void.*

Signature, \_\_\_\_\_

Raleigh Historic Development Commission

*Pending the resolution of appeals, commencement of work is at your own risk.*



# Planning & Development

Development Services  
 Customer Service Center  
 One Exchange Plaza  
 1 Exchange Plaza, Suite 400  
 Raleigh, North Carolina 27601  
 Phone 919-996-2495  
 eFax 919-996-1831

## Raleigh Historic Development Commission – Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) Application



RALEIGH HISTORIC DEVELOPMENT COMMISSION

- Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy
- Major Work (COA Committee review) – 13 copies
  - Most Major Work Applications
  - Additions Greater than 25% of Building Square Footage
  - New Buildings
  - Demo of Contributing Historic Resource
- Post Approval Re-review of Conditions of Approval

**For Office Use Only**

Transaction # 460887  
 File # 025-16-MW  
 Fee 2900  
 Amt Paid 2900  
 Check # 3626  
 Rec'd Date 02/01/16  
 Rec'd By P. Best

• If completing by hand, please use **BLACK INK**. Do not use blue, red, any other color, or pencil as these do not photocopy.

Property Street Address 404 Elm Street, Raleigh, NC 27604  
 Historic District Oakwood  
 Historic Property/Landmark name (if applicable) Pullen-Wynne House  
 Owner's Name Susan S. Iddings  
 Lot size 1/3 acre (width in feet) approximately 71' (depth in feet) 182' (south border) + 213' (north)

For applications that require review by the COA Committee (Major Work), provide addressed, stamped envelopes to owners of all properties within 100 feet (i.e. both sides, in front (across the street), and behind the property) not including the width of public streets or alleys:

Property Address	Property Address

I understand that all applications that require review by the commission's Certificate of Appropriateness Committee must be submitted by 4:00 p.m. on the application deadline; otherwise, consideration will be delayed until the following committee meeting. An incomplete application will not be accepted.



Type or print the following:

Applicant Susan S. Iddings

Mailing Address 611 Polk Street, ~~Raleigh, NC 27604~~

City Raleigh State NC Zip Code 27604

Date 2/1/2016 Daytime Phone 919 832 3978

Email Address susaniddings@gmail.com

Signature of Applicant *Susan S. Iddings*

**Minor Work Approval (office use only)**

Upon being signed and dated below by the Planning Director or designee, this application becomes the Minor Work Certificate of Appropriateness. It is valid until 8/8/16. Please post the enclosed placard form of the certificate as indicated at the bottom of the card. Issuance of a Minor Work Certificate shall not relieve the applicant, contractor, tenant, or property owner from obtaining any other permit required by City Code or any law. Minor work projects not approved by staff will be forwarded to the Certificate of Appropriateness Committee for review at the next scheduled meeting.

Signature *[Signature]* Date 2/8/16

**Project Categories (check all that apply):**

- Exterior Alteration
- Addition
- New Construction
- Demolition

Will you be applying for state or federal rehabilitation tax credits for this project?

- Yes
- No

**(Office Use Only)**

Type of Work 60122

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

**Design Guidelines** Please cite the applicable sections of the design guidelines ([www.rhdc.org](http://www.rhdc.org)).

Section/Page	Topic	Brief Description of Work
3.5/34	Roofs	1) Replace deteriorated metal trim, flashing
3.3/30	Architectural Metals	around chimneys, cricket, <sup>on slate roofs</sup> downspouts, hidden
3.8/42	Entrances, Porches, But- omies	gutter lining with copper. 2) Replace asphalt shingles on front porch with copper standing seam roof. 3) Replace deteriorated metal roof on back 2-story addition with copper standing-
		seam roof. 4) Remove chimney (non-functional) on back roof of 2-story addition.

	TO BE COMPLETED BY APPLICANT		TO BE COMPLETED BY CITY STAFF		
	YES	N/A	YES	NO	N/A
<p>Attach 8-1/2" x 11" sheets with written descriptions and drawings, photographs, and other graphic information necessary to completely describe the project. Use the checklist below to be sure your application is complete.</p> <p><b>Minor Work (staff review) – 1 copy</b></p> <p><b>Major Work (COA Committee review) – 13 copies</b></p>					
1. <b>Written description.</b> Describe clearly and in detail the nature of your project. Include exact dimensions for materials to be used (e.g. width of siding, window trim, etc.)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
2. <b>Description of materials</b> (Provide samples, if appropriate)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
3. <b>Photographs</b> of existing conditions are required.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				
4. <b>Paint Schedule</b> (if applicable)	n/a	<input type="checkbox"/>			
5. <b>Plot plan</b> (if applicable). A plot plan showing relationship of buildings, additions, sidewalks, drives, trees, property lines, etc., must be provided if your project includes any addition, demolition, fences/walls, or other landscape work. Show accurate measurements. You may also use a copy of the survey you received when you bought your property. Revise the copy as needed to show existing conditions and your proposed work.	n/a	<input type="checkbox"/>			
6. <b>Drawings</b> showing proposed work <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Plan drawings</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Elevation drawings showing the new façade(s).</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> Dimensions shown on drawings and/or graphic scale.</li> <li><input type="checkbox"/> 8-1/2" x 11" reductions of full-size drawings. If reduced size is so small as to be illegible, make 8-1/2" x 11" snap shots of individual drawings on the big sheet.</li> </ul>	n/a	<input type="checkbox"/>			
7. Stamped envelopes addressed to all property owners within 100 feet of property not counting the width of public streets and alleys. (Required for Major Work)	n/a	<input type="checkbox"/>			
8. <b>Fee (See Development Fee Schedule)</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>				



From: **Susan Iddings** susaniddings@gmail.com  
Subject: Minor Work COA Application - 404 Elm Street  
Date: Today at 9:05 PM  
To: susaniddings@gmail.com

Re: Minor Work COA to allow (1) the use of copper to replace deteriorated metal trim on slate roofs, flashing around chimneys, metal cricket, hidden gutter system lining, downspouts and to replace both the asphalt shingle roof on the front porch and the deteriorated standing-seam metal roof on the back 2-story addition with copper standing-seam roofs and (2) to remove the chimney that penetrates the roof of the back 2-story addition.

To the staff who review applications for Minor Work COA Applications:

The roof at [404 Elm Street](#) consists of three distinct parts:

1- The main 2-story structure, which is constructed of brick covered with stucco, has two original slate roofs separated by a metal cricket that runs parallel to the front of the house. The front slate roof is of a steeper pitch than the back slate roof.

The slates that are broken or missing need to be replaced. Otherwise the slate is in very good condition. The metal cricket, the flashing around the chimney bases, and the metal valleys and other trim metal are in deteriorated condition and much of it needs to be replaced.

2- The original front porch was replaced between 1915-1920 with a wrap-around front porch. The roof of the front porch is currently covered with asphalt shingles. I do not think shingles were the original porch roofing material but I have not been able to establish what the roofing material was when the front porch was first added on. The front porch roof is not a feature of the house or the front porch and is only somewhat visible from the street.

3- The original back porch appears to have been replaced with a 2-story addition covered with wood siding when the house was converted to four apartments in the early 1950's. The roof of this addition is currently covered in a standing-seam metal that is likely original to the addition. The condition of this roof is very deteriorated. It has been patched often, not in accordance with the guidelines, and has been the source of frequent active leaking into the rooms below, on one occasion since the fall of 2014 on both floors.

A chimney that penetrates this roof is of no known past or current function (it dead ends in the crawl space). The chimney blocks the doorway from the main house to the addition about four feet inside that addition on both the first and



second floors, thereby interfering with a view through those doorways to the back yard and interfering with easy passage through those doors.

The roof on the back addition is not visible from the street.

The slate roofs, the front porch roof, and the back addition roof are all surrounded by a wooden hidden gutter system that has the original metal lining. The metal lining is in deteriorated condition. The hidden gutter system was poorly maintained for many years, most of the gutters and downspouts do not function properly, and in one location the downspout is truncated 3-4 feet below the top slate roof. The resulting active leaking caused by the failed gutters have severely damaged the exterior stucco in places, mostly the front of the house on the upper level, and damaged some of the front porch woodwork, the wooden gutters themselves, and the metal lining of the gutters. Oak City Artisans is currently repairing as-is the wooden gutter system, except for the metal lining.

As soon as the repairs of the wooden gutter system are complete, Christian Nonino has agreed to replace the missing and broken slates on the slate roofs, replace all the metal valleys and other metal trim, chimney flashings, cricket, hidden gutter system lining, and downspouts with copper, using the same forms as the original trims and downspout, as well as replace the front porch roof and back addition roof with copper 1" tall, double-locked, standing-seam roofs. I expect the RHDC and its staff are familiar with the high quality work that Christian Nonino has done on roofs on historic houses in Raleigh over the years. *flat pan*

I request a minor work COA that will authorize the use of copper as the replacement metal for all the work to be done by Christian Nonino and that will authorize the removal of the non-functioning chimney that penetrates the roof of the back 2-story addition from the 1950's. I want to use copper for the roof metal because of its durability over many decades and because it needs little maintenance compared to either the use of other new roofing metals or the use of recoating materials that allow one to retain the metal that is there now. Please note that the one metal roof on the back addition that is a candidate for recoating is not original to the house, nor is the front porch that is now covered in asphalt shingles. Further, the type of metal that was used for the roof on the back 2-story addition is no longer produced. A copper roof on the front porch and on the back 2-story addition and the use of copper for all the metal on the slate roofs and for the downspouts would not damage or diminish the historic character of the Pullen-Wynne House.





Front of 404 Elm Street  
facing Elm Street



South side of 404 Elm Street  
facing Oakwood Avenue



metal cricket  
between slate roofs,  
showing chimneys



front porch





standing-seam metal roof on back 2-story addition  
added in early 1950's



same as above, showing non-functioning  
chimney that I request to remove in  
this minor work COA application



section of  
top of hidden gutter system,  
showing indication of  
deterioration



truncated downspout